

DEVELOPMENTS IN THE LAW
JOBS AND BORDERS

"The happiness of men consists in life. And life is in labor."

Lyof Nikolayevitch Tolstoi, *quoted in* JOHN BARTLETT,
FAMILIAR QUOTATIONS 996
(Nathan Haskell Dole ed., 10th ed., 1923).

"The lofty moral tone of the opponents of globalization is possible only because they have chosen not to think their position through. While fat-cat capitalists might benefit from globalization, the biggest beneficiaries are, yes, Third World workers."

Paul Krugman, *In Praise of Cheap Labor:
Bad Jobs at Bad Wages Are Better Than No Jobs at All*,
SLATE (Mar. 21, 1997), at <http://www.slate.com/id/1918>.

"If we neglect to regulate globalization with laws, it will end up impoverishing mankind."

President Jacques Chirac, Speech at the High-Level Roundtable on
Cultural Diversity and Biodiversity for Sustainable Development
(Sept. 3, 2002), *in* GOVERNING COUNCIL OF THE UNITED
NATIONS ENV'T PROGRAMME, OUTCOME OF THE WORLD
SUMMIT ON SUSTAINABLE DEVELOPMENT 14 (2002).

"In this era of globalization no doubt borders have become fluid and the designation of territorial and extraterritorial jurisdiction often times seems like an outdated false binary. Nonetheless, the laws of the United States cannot and do not automatically circumscribe the conduct of all crimes contemplated or committed around the globe."

United States v. Cafiero, 242 F. Supp. 2d 49, 54 (D. Mass. 2003).

"The American flag stands for more than our power and our interests. Our Founders dedicated this country to the cause of human dignity, the rights of every person and the possibilities of every life. This conviction leads us into the world to help the afflicted . . ."

149 CONG. REC. H213 (daily ed. Jan. 28, 2003)
(State of the Union Address of President George W. Bush).

TABLE OF CONTENTS

I. INTRODUCTION.....	2175
II. THE TRAFFICKING VICTIMS PROTECTION ACT	2180
A. <i>Understanding Human Trafficking</i>	2183
B. <i>Recent Legislative Developments</i>	2188
1. Prevention.....	2189
(a) Programs	2189
(b) Sanctions.....	2190
2. Protection.....	2191
3. Prosecution	2192
C. <i>Reconciling Policy with Implementation</i>	2193
1. Putting Aside Prevention and Protection.....	2194
2. The Problems with the Prosecution-Centered Strategy	2196
(a) Expansion of Liability	2196
(b) Increasing Sentences	2199
3. The Expressive “Value”	2200
D. <i>Conclusion</i>	2201
III. LEGAL TOOLS FOR ALTERING LABOR CONDITIONS ABROAD.....	2202
A. <i>The International Approach to Labor Standards</i>	2205
1. “Core Standards” Approach	2205
2. The Possibility of International Enforcement	2207
B. <i>Domestic Legal Tools To Enforce Labor Standards Abroad</i>	2209
1. Transnational Regulation	2209
(a) Worker Rights in Domestic Trade Legislation	2209
(b) Labor Provisions in Preferential Trade Agreements	2212
2. Judicial Review of Federal Administrative Action.....	2215
3. Private Litigation: The Alien Tort Claims Act	2217
C. <i>Market-Based Tools: Modes of Corporate Social Responsibility</i>	2220
1. Corporate Codes of Conduct	2220
2. Shareholder Resolutions	2222
D. <i>Conclusion</i>	2223
IV. LEGAL PROTECTIONS FOR ILLEGAL WORKERS	2224
A. <i>Striking a Balance: Hoffman Plastic Compounds, Inc. v. NLRB</i>	2225
B. <i>Losing Balance: Recent Developments</i>	2229
1. Worker Protections Lost.....	2229
(a) Preemption.....	2230
(i) <i>Hernandez-Cortez v. Hernandez</i>	2230
(ii) <i>Veliz v. Rental Service Corp. USA</i>	2231
(iii) <i>Sanango v. 200 East 16th Street Housing Corp</i>	2231
(b) Persuasion.....	2232
(c) Discovery.....	2233
2. Little Enforcement Gained	2234
(a) The Fact of Unenforcement	2235
(b) Four Facets of Unenforcement	2236

(i) Conflict with Moral Values	2236
(ii) Globalization-Fueled Demand	2237
(iii) Failed Federalism	2239
(iv) The I-9 as a Laundering Device	2240
(v) Unenforcement Summary	2241
C. <i>Restoring Balance: Recommendations</i>	2241
1. Restoring Worker Protections	2241
(a) Reject Preemption	2242
(i) <i>Tyson Foods, Inc. v. Guzman</i>	2242
(ii) <i>Madeira v. Affordable Housing Foundation, Inc.</i> and <i>Cano v. Mallory Management</i>	2242
(b) Affirm Protections: California's Legislative Response	2243
(c) Reorient Discovery Protection	2244
2. Enabling Enforcement	2245
D. <i>Conclusion</i>	2246
V. THE CONSTITUTIONALITY OF IMMIGRATION FEDERALISM	2247
A. <i>Statutory and Doctrinal Background</i>	2248
1. The Personal Responsibility and Work Opportunity Reconciliation Act of 1996	2248
2. State Responses to PRWORA	2249
3. The Doctrinal Backdrop: <i>Graham</i> and <i>Mathews</i>	2251
(a) <i>Graham v. Richardson</i>	2251
(b) <i>Mathews v. Diaz</i>	2252
4. Recent Constitutional Litigation of PRWORA's Alienage Provisions	2253
(a) <i>Aliessa v. Novello</i>	2255
(b) <i>Soskin v. Reinertson</i>	2256
B. <i>Assessing PRWORA's Constitutionality</i>	2257
1. The Inapplicability of the Uniformity Requirement	2258
(a) Uniformity's Limited Scope	2258
(b) Other Sources of the Immigration Power	2260
2. The Constitutionality of Federally Authorized State Alienage Classifications	2262
(a) Concurrent State Power To Regulate Alien Welfare Eligibility	2263
(b) Delegation of the Immigration Power	2267
C. <i>Conclusion</i>	2268
VI. DRAWING LINES AROUND CORPORATE INVERSION	2270
A. <i>The Corporate Inversion Process and Surrounding Controversy</i>	2272
1. The Corporate Inversion Process	2272
2. Stanley Works's Inversion Attempt	2274
B. <i>Motivations for and Arguments Against Corporate Inversion</i>	2275
1. Reasons for Corporation Expatriation	2275
(a) U.S. Taxation on Income Earned Abroad	2275
(b) U.S. Treatment of Interest Expenses	2277
(c) Earnings Stripping	2278
2. Policy Concerns Regarding Corporate Expatriation	2279
(a) Concern for Shareholders	2279

(b) Tax-Based Arguments Against Inversion	2281
C. <i>Attempts To Combat Corporate Inversion</i>	2282
1. Efforts To Discourage Corporate Inversion.....	2282
2. Latest Effort: The American Jobs Creation Act of 2004	2284
(a) Removing Incentives and Imposing Penalties —	
New I.R.C. § 7874.....	2284
(b) More Incentives Against Expatriation —	
New I.R.C. §§ 4985, 6043A	2287
(c) The Effect of the Jobs Act.....	2288
D. <i>The Current “Line in the Law”</i>	2289